When Online Instruction Doesn’t Measure Up

How can you tell? And what should you do?

Marcia Rapchak, EdD
Head, Teaching and Learning
Gumberg Library
Duquesne University

DLS Conference
San Antonio, TX
April 11-13, 2018
Context

Required
One-credit
Core Curriculum
Taught by librarians and adjunct instructors
2016 Online Course

14 weeks
20 students per section
Capstone assignment – group assignment
Journals, individual assignments, one group discussion assignment
Based on Standards and Framework
Assignment: Your group will collaboratively determine a research question based on a broader topic. You will then conduct a search in the resources described in this course and critique your search. You should include this information in a report that details:

- **The topic and research questions.** This will also include a description and justification of the types of sources that will best meet your information needs.

- **Your group’s search strategy,** including:
  - At least 3 search tools you used (e.g., discovery system, ProQuest Central, and Academic Search Elite)
  - The terms / subject headings / keywords you searched
  - What difficulties you faced, and
  - (optional) How you used sources to find other sources

- **A critique of your group’s search strategy** that explains what you did well and what you would improve if you had time to do so. Consider:
  - Did you use appropriate databases or search engines?
  - Did you use the best search terms?
  - Did you try alternate terms?
  - Did you use Boolean searching?
  - What could you have done to make your searching more effective?

- **5 useful sources you found in your search cited** with a **CRAAP analysis** included for the source under each citation.

- **At least one Creative Commons image** relevant to your Capstone, placed appropriately in the text, and cited correctly.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Capstone Group 10: Are school dress codes sexist?</th>
<th>Capstone Group 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Capstone Group 11: Should Americans have a “right to be forgotten” online?</td>
<td>Capstone Group 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capstone Group 12: What are the ethical issues raised by self-driving cars?</td>
<td>Capstone Group 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capstone Group 1: Does social media cause narcissism?</td>
<td>Capstone Group 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capstone Group 2: Is sampling (in music) a copyright violation or creativity?</td>
<td>Capstone Group 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/27/16</td>
<td>10:37 AM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/27/16</td>
<td>10:37 AM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/12/16</td>
<td>9:52 AM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/1/16</td>
<td>11:52 AM</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Anecdotally...
Assessment

- Learning outcomes assessment
- Student self-report of social metacognition
- Course evaluations
- Withdraws and failures
## Learning Outcomes Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Identified Alternate Keywords</th>
<th>Appropriate (% that identified)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Face to Face</td>
<td>88.89% (of 18)</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online</td>
<td>73.91% (of 23)</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Social Metacognition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Metacognition</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Social metacognition</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Face-to-face</strong></td>
<td>261</td>
<td>3.985</td>
<td>.035</td>
<td>3.805</td>
<td>.042</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Online</strong></td>
<td>48</td>
<td>3.926</td>
<td>.079</td>
<td>3.185</td>
<td>.127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>309</td>
<td>3.976</td>
<td>.032</td>
<td>3.708</td>
<td>.043</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Likert Scale of 5
Course Evaluations

Online: 3.44/5
Face to face: 4.13/5

Online: 31 withdrawals, 9 incompletes, 8 dropped
Face to face: 4 withdrawals, 2 incompletes, 19 cancel / dropped

Online: 65% B- or better
Face to face: A little over 82% B- or better
What went wrong?

Mistakes were made

Image courtesy of Bored Panda
Revisions

- Shorter format
- Fully integrated Framework
- New assignment
- More support for group learning
- Scaffolded assignments
- New instructors
New Learning Goals

Students define scholarship as a conversation
Students evaluate sources with an understanding of context
Students recognize that information has value and use information ethically
Students search strategically in a flexible and exploratory manner
Students assess the fit between an information source and a particular information need
Curriculum Based on Framework

- Week 1: The Information Cycle
- Week 2: Searching as Strategic Exploration
- Week 3: Authority is Constructed and Contextual
- Week 4: Information Has Value
Curriculum Based on Framework

Different Perspectives PPT
Attached Files: Looking at Different Perspectives.pptx (714.059 KB)
This is a ppt of the lecture on Exploring Different Perspectives.

Considering Different Perspectives - Click here to submit
Attached Files: Considering Different Perspectives lesson 2 online.docx (12.884 KB)
Please download the assignment, complete it, and submit it here.
Curriculum Based on Framework

Authorities on Higher Education and First-Generation Students

Angelica Villanueva

• Kansas State University alumnus
• Was a first-generation college student
• Science teacher at Dodge City High School

Vanessa Correa

• Associate Director for first-generation initiatives in the Office of Diversity, Inclusion, and Multicultural Education (ODIME) at George Mason University (GMU).
• Program director for the Student Transition Empowerment Program (STEP), which helps first-generation students transition to college
• Has a background in correctional education
New Final Assignment

Problem-based learning
Authentic problem
New Final Assignment

Your website should include:

An introduction that

- Describes the problem and includes questions you developed related to the problem
- An explanation of your interest in this problem from the perspective of your assigned stakeholder position

At least ten relevant and useful sources on your topic cited (provide author, title, date, and, if applicable, the link to the resource). You will need at least six (5) sources that stakeholders would have access to, at least three (3) sources available to you as your role as an expert, and at least one (1) source from a relevant organization. Under each citation provide:

- A description of how each resource helps you to solve your problem
- An evaluation of the source – Why is this source valuable to you? What does it provide that is unique, informative, and/or authoritative? What might be missing in the source? Might it be biased?
- A summary section about what actions your group recommends and why, given the information you have found in your research
- 5 creative commons images throughout the website (should be cited with the photo credit and link)
New Final Assignment Topics

• You are a group of college administrators, and several of your students have complained about the lack of racial equity on campus. Faculty and other students have discriminated against minority students. There is going to be a community town hall meeting about how you plan to improve the situation.

• You are on a student activities board, and a student group wants to bring in a controversial speaker. The speaker has offensive views – racist, sexist, and ethnocentric. However, some students believe that bringing the speaker to campus will “open dialogue.” You need to convince the administration that they should bar the speaker from being invited to campus.

• Your state legislature is considering a bill that requires individuals use the restroom that corresponds to the sex they were assigned on their birth certificate. You work for a group that lobbies for the rights of LGBTQ youth. You need to convince the legislators not to pass the bill.
### Group Learning Support

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Thread</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Unread Posts</th>
<th>Total Posts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7/30/17 10:04 PM</td>
<td>Finalizing our Sources</td>
<td></td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/23/17 7:25 PM</td>
<td>Website</td>
<td></td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/23/17 12:49 PM</td>
<td>Debating with Research - Week 5</td>
<td>Marcia Rapchak</td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/22/17 11:46 AM</td>
<td>Google Doc Progress Report</td>
<td></td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/17/17 7:58 AM</td>
<td>Creative Commons Images</td>
<td></td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/16/17 2:09 AM</td>
<td>author of intro, the introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/15/17 10:08 AM</td>
<td>Group Progress Report - Week 4</td>
<td>Marcia Rapchak</td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/11/17 7:29 PM</td>
<td>Gathering Our Sources</td>
<td></td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/9/17 12:16 PM</td>
<td>Annotation</td>
<td>Marcia Rapchak</td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/9/17 12:08 PM</td>
<td>Week 3 - Assembling Your Team</td>
<td>Marcia Rapchak</td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/2/17 6:07 PM</td>
<td>Google Doc for Final Assignment Report</td>
<td>Marcia Rapchak</td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/1/17 10:46 AM</td>
<td>Team Contract</td>
<td>Marcia Rapchak</td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/30/17 9:32 AM</td>
<td>Group Roles</td>
<td>Marcia Rapchak</td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/22/17 5:02 PM</td>
<td>Group Topic</td>
<td>Marcia Rapchak</td>
<td>Published</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Individual and Group Assignments

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 2 | • Searching for Different Perspectives  
• Searching in the Databases  
• Find three sources on your topic as an individual and post links (or the)  
   | 5 | Boolean Searching Video  
   |   | Boolean Tutorial  
   |   | Search Strategies: Design, Refine, Adjust  
   |   | Search Smarter  
   |   | Academic Search Elite Tutorial  
   |   | ProQuest Central Tutorial  
   |   | QuickSearch Videos  
   |   | Complete Group Contract  
   |   | Create a final assignment Google Doc and make sure all group members have access |
New Instructors

Required Qualifications

- Experience using a Learning Management System
- Library instruction experience
- A Master’s degree in Library Science, Information Science, or equivalent
Revision Results
Fall 2017 Assessment

Finding a variety of sources relevant to the topic (out of 5)
Goal was an average of 4/5
F2F: 4.44
Online: 4.22

$t$-test indicated not significantly different
Recommendations
Assignment Design

Created by Rob Armes from Noun Project
Scaffolding Assignments

Can you break your assignments down into smaller pieces?

Low-stake collaborative opportunities?

Can you have students post their assignments for others to see / respond to?
Welcome! 

Posted on: Monday, January 8, 2018 1:59:42 PM EST

Welcome to UCOR 100. Research and Information Skills! Classes don’t start until Wednesday, but I thought I’d post this so you can start thinking about what classes are like and what you need to do. 

In Blackboard, you will find information on How-Tos, the Final Assignment, and Lessons. Also, see my welcome video in Announcements. Please let me know if you have any questions.

Dr. Rapchak
Newspaper Articles

Posted on: Thursday, January 18, 2018 9:13:52 AM EST

Most newspapers are online now, so the limitations of print editions don’t apply. Check out this tutorial I made to learn more about when different formats might be beneficial: http://duq.libsurveys.com/loader.php?id=51a6685ec0c43a897c725e7e5734c011

Week 2

 Posted on: Tuesday, January 16, 2018 7:14:01 AM EST

In Week 2, which you will find under Lessons, we will jump right in to searching the library systems (both databases and catalog). We will also consider how different perspectives are not always represented by these systems, so we may need to go elsewhere to find them. These are the resources you will be using throughout your academic career; many of your professors will require that you use library resources. In this week, we focus on Academic Search Elite and ProQuest Central, which are multidisciplinary databases, but we have hundreds of databases. These can all be found by going to the Gumberg Library website, clicking on Research Databases on the top left, and then choosing a subject in the dropdown, or scrolling through the A-Z list.

Let me know if you have questions!

Dr. Rapchak
Instructor Interaction: Content Delivery

The Information Cycle and Information Access
Instructor Feedback

cence officers, the African American community and Rodney king

tances and answer the questions below:

- use a government website? news site? blog? etc.) to find the

formation.

formation. What did you search in this resource? Did you need

formation. If you have to modify your search to find sources? Describe examp

e officer perspective on Rodney king” and I came up with a lot

ow many police officers changed their ways after the incident, related to their perspective.
Support for Collaboration

- Google Hangouts
- GoToMeeting
- Slack
- Google Drive
- Skype
- GroupMe
Support for Collaboration

Clear roles

Clear group assignments
  X person will do A
  Y person will review A and add B

Metacognitive / social metacognitive considerations
  What are your goals? What strategies will you use?
Assessment

Student evaluations only tell part of the story

Is Gender Bias an Intended Feature of Teaching Evaluations?

Such evaluations pretend to be the result of a neutral process but are better measures of student stereotypes than teaching effectiveness, argues Victor Ray.

By Victor Ray // February 9, 2018

Zero Correlation Between Evaluations and Learning

New study adds to evidence that student reviews of professors have limited validity.

By Colleen Flaherty // September 21, 2016
Assessment Steps

1. Determine desired results
2. Identify what evidence would indicate achievement
3. Design assignment that would provide this evidence
Example Assessment Development

1. Identify interested parties, such as scholars, organizations, governments, and industries, who might produce information about a topic and then determine how to access that information.

2. Students use a variety of sources for their final assignment.

3. Final assignment required open access, library-access, and an organization.
Assessment
Full Disclosure Time

Experience

Tell us your experiences. How did implicit bias affect you?

EDUCATE US
Future Steps

- Online Training
- No Group Final Project
- More Explicit Instructions for Assignments
Thank you for your time!
Resources Consulted


